**Acupuncture for chronic primary pain – are UK guidelines now consistent with other countries?**

Short running title Acupuncture for chronic primary pain, UK guidelines

Stephen Birch1, Mark Bovey2, Nicola Robinson3,4

1 Kristiania University College, School of Health Sciences, Oslo, Norway

2 British Acupuncture Council, London UK

3 School of Health and Social Care, London South Bank University, UK

4 Centre for Evidence-based Chinese Medicine, Beijing University of Chinese Medicine

Prof Nicola Robinson ORCHID 0000-0001-5256-4527

Dr Stephen Birch ORCHID 0000-0001-7986-6568

Mark Bovey ORCHID 0000-0002-0113-3441

Corresponding author

Stephen Birch

Kristiania University College,

School of Health Sciences, Kirkegata 24-26,

0153 Oslo,

Norway

E mail sjbirch@gmail.com

All e mails     sjbirch@gmail.com;‎  m.bovey@acupuncture.org.uk;  [nicky.robinson@lsbu.ac.uk](about:blank)

Abstract

Introduction

Chronic pain was reclassified by the World Health Organisation in 2019 into primary and secondary chronic pain. Clinical guidelines on chronic primary pain recently issued in the UK for consultation by the National Institute of Health and Care Excellence (NICE) have included acupuncture as a primary treatment. The aim of this article was to explore the evidence in support of this recommendation and gauge whether NICE is in line with international guidelines.

Methods

UK clinical guideline recommendations on the use of acupuncture for chronic pain were compared with selected key national and international guidelines to identify whether acupuncture is included and whether it is recommended.

Results

By recommending acupuncture as a potential treatment for chronic primary pain, NICE is now in line with clinical guideline recommendations from within the UK nations (Scotland, Wales) and other countries such as the USA, Australia, Canada, New Zealand, Germany, Austria as well as organizations such as the British Pain Society and the European Pain Federation

Conclusions

The problems of drug dependency especially overuse of opioids and their associated unwanted side effects suggest that non-pharmacological methods that can deal with chronic pain are imperative. Acupuncture provides a bone fide choice particularly as its evidence of effectiveness continues to grow.

**Keywords: Acupuncture; Clinical guidelines; Pain; National Institute of Health and Care Excellence (NICE)**

**Introduction**

In the World Health Organization’s (WHO) 2019 update of the International Classification of Diseases (ICD-11), chronic pain was classified as either chronic primary pain or chronic secondary pain [1,2]. The new definition for chronic pain is; pain, persisting for longer than 3 months, causing significant emotional distress and/or disability and therefore recognised as a health condition in its own right. It includes for example conditions such as, fibromyalgia, chronic migraine, irritable bowel syndrome and non-specific back pain. Chronic secondary pain syndromes relate to pain which is a symptom of another underlying cause, such as sequelae of cancer treatments or surgery.

**The new UK chronic pain guideline**

The UK’s National Institute of Health and Care Excellence **(**NICE) released the draft of new guidelines for the treatment of chronic pain and chronic primary pain for comment on August 3, 2020 [3]. This is written for health professionals, health commissioners and service providers and people with chronic pain. It refers to previous NICE guidelines for a number of chronic pain conditions and then details treatment recommendations for chronic primary pain.

The guideline group evaluated evidence of effectiveness and safety across a wide range of interventions. Problems of drug dependency (e.g. opioids) and other unwanted side effects of medications have become more important in recent years [4]. Increasingly pain experts are recommending non-pharmacological treatments ahead of pharmacological treatments and positioning opioids lower down the list of treatment options for chronic pain [5-7]. In this new guidance NICE also recommends a number of non-pharmacological interventions as primary therapies in preference to pharmacological interventions, with the exception of anti-depressants.

The therapies that are to be offered as possible treatments are those with best evidence in terms of effectiveness and safety and were defined as follows:

* Primary treatments are: exercise, psychological therapy, acupuncture and anti-depressants
* Treatments for which evidence exists but that require further research before concrete recommendations can be made are: pain management programs, social interventions and manual therapy
* Therapies that have poor evidence and should not be used are: electrical physical modalities - TENS, ultrasound, interferential therapy
* With the exception of anti-depressants, the group recommended against use of other drugs, saying: “Do not offer any of the following, by any route, to people aged 16 years and over to manage chronic primary pain”: Opioids, NSAIDs, benzodiazepines, anti-epileptics, local anaesthetics, local anaesthetic/corticosteroid combinations, paracetamol, ketamine, corticosteroids, antipsychotics.

Therefore the guideline has suggested that only anti-depressants, exercise, psychological therapy and acupuncture should be the treatments offered for chronic primary pain, which represents a radical departure for NICE from previous recommendations.

The usual management of chronic pain has involved use of pain management programs, psychosocial interventions, pharmacological interventions and various non-pharmacological interventions. Problems with opioids are well known [8] due to the ‘opioid crisis’ [7]. Not only are opioids not effective for chronic pain [9], but addiction and other side effects are very significant [9-11]. Groups around the world have been seeking different approaches to pain management that do not use or minimise use of opioids [5-7,12].Thus recent approaches have looked across different interventions with the same eyes in order to identify more appropriate treatment approaches for chronic pain. With the exception of anti-depressants, the NICE review group found very limited or no evidence of effectiveness for treatment of chronic pain by other pharmacological interventions.

In 2016, this journal highlighted the removal of acupuncture from the previous 2009 NICE guidelines on the management and treatment of low back pain and sciatica [13]. Lai pointed out that the benefits of acupuncture in reducing pain compared to usual care were found to be above the threshold for clinical relevance [14]. We focus on the recommendations regarding acupuncture since they are clearly at odds with other recent NICE guidance on the use of acupuncture for various conditions [15-17], though headache is an exception [18].

**Acupuncture is recommended for chronic pain in other UK guidelines**

Many healthcare providers in the UK are unaware that NICE has recommended acupuncture for chronic pain since 2008 [19]. Spinal cord stimulation guidelines were first published by NICE in 2008, were reapproved in 2014 [15] and are still current [https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/ta159]. Since spinal cord stimulation is a therapy that has potential for causing harm, the guidelines recommend use of other interventions first, including acupuncture [19]. Perhaps this is one of the reasons why in their central online publications about acupuncture the National Health Service (NHS), since at least 2016, has stated acupuncture can be used for chronic pain [16]. The prioritisation of the use of acupuncture for chronic pain by NICE in this new guideline brings it up to date with recommendations from other UK regions and expert groups. Acupuncture has been recommended for treatment of chronic pain by Scotland’s equivalent organization to NICE, the Scottish Intercollegiate Network (SIGN), first in 2013 [20], reaffirmed in 2018 [21] and again in 2019 [22], in particular for chronic low back pain and osteoarthritis of the knee. The All Wales Medicine Strategy Group likewise recommends acupuncture for chronic pain [23] as has the British Pain Society since at least 2010 [24].

**Acupuncture is recommended for chronic pain in international guidelines**

The new NICE guidelines also parallel increasing numbers of publications from governments and expert groups in other countries. The American Chronic Pain Association has recommended acupuncture since at least 2014 [25]. Among many Government and National Agencies in the US, the Joint Commission [26] and the US Department of Health and Human Services [27] recommend acupuncture for chronic pain. The Australian Government recommends acupuncture for chronic pain [28] as does the Royal New Zealand College of General Practitioners [29] and the Australian national guideline group ‘Therapeutic Guidelines’ [eTG 2012] and the Government of South Australia [8] . The Government of Canada [Government of Canada 2019] and the Canadian group ‘Çhoosing Wisely Canada’ in 2020 <https://choosingwiselycanada.org/patient-pamphlet-opioids/> likewise recommend acupuncture for chronic pain. The European Pain Federation prepared a report on behalf of the European Parliament recommending acupuncture as a treatment option for chronic pain in 2010 [31]. The German Federal Joint Committee recommends acupuncture for chronic pain [33] as does the Austrian Ludwig Boltzmann Institute for Health Technology Assessment [34].

**Discussion**

**A ‘sea change’ for NICE? Comparison with the guidance on low back pain and osteoarthritis**

NICE’s recent stance against acupuncture for knee osteoarthritis [NICE 2014] and low back pain [NICE 2016] revealed a possibly worrying trend, that the guideline group leadership was potentially biased in their analyses and approach to acupuncture [35-37]. For example at almost exactly the same time NICE completed its analysis and published the 2016 guidelines on low back pain, the US Agency for Health Care Research and Quality and the American College of Physicians, analysing the same data drew entirely opposite conclusions about the effectiveness of acupuncture for chronic low back pain [38] leading to recommendations for use of acupuncture in 2017 as one of the first line interventions [39] . SIGN’s recommendations to use acupuncture for low back pain and knee osteoarthritis in 2013 and again 2018 also runs contrary to NICE’s approach for these conditions. Perhaps there has been a change of leadership at NICE or perhaps a different guideline group has been willing to apply an unbiased contextualised analysis of all the data for acupuncture, but whatever the reason, it is a breath of fresh air for the acupuncture field and for patients suffering from chronic pain in the UK. The NHS has been recommending acupuncture regularly for chronic pain since at least 2016 [16], but the lack of NICE recognition of acupuncture has led to reduced NHS acupuncture services. This new NICE guideline should open the way for better and more equitable NHS coverage for acupuncture in the treatment of chronic pain. The fact that acupuncture shows evidence of cost-effectiveness for chronic pain should also inform the process of funding for this NICE recommendation [40-46].

In recent guidelines NICE has emphasised acupuncture-sham comparison results above all else, leading to recommending against acupuncture for low back pain and osteoarthritis [35-37]. However, acupuncture for chronic pain out-performs sham with a difference large enough to be deemed clinically significant (1.0 on a 0-10 VAS). This begs the question whether NICE would have still recommended acupuncture for chronic pain if it had not achieved the required superiority over sham – despite being clinically better than usual care and also cost effective (as was the case for LBP and osteoarthritis), it may also be the start of a recognition of the significant problems of sham acupuncture as a control intervention [47-50]. This would bring acupuncture more into line with non-pharmacological interventions like exercise, manual and psychological therapies, where sham controls have no credibility.

**Chronic pain associated with comorbidity**

Chronic primary pain, like chronic pain syndrome, is a complex condition characterised by not only chronic pain, but also with significant other problems. It includes pain in one or more anatomical regions that “(1) persists or recurs for longer than 3 months, (2) is associated with significant emotional distress (e.g., anxiety, anger, frustration, or depressed mood) and/or significant functional disability (interference in activities of daily life and participation in social roles), and (3) and the symptoms are not better accounted for by another diagnosis.” [1]. Chronic pain syndrome is defined as pain that has persisted for at least three months with affective problems, sleep problems, fatigue, common problems with misuse of prescribed and non-prescribed drugs [51] and can be found classified as a psychiatric condition [52] . Since acupuncture has not only shown weak to moderate evidence of effectiveness in general [53-55], and specifically for chronic pain [55-59] there is evidence for its long term treatment effects [60]. It also some promising evidence for affective problems like depression [61,62,63] including chronic pain with depression [64, 65], anxiety [66,67], addiction problems [68,69], sleep problems [70], and fatigue [71], therefore acupuncture can potentially help the chronic primary pain/chronic pain syndrome patient with more than just the pain [72].

**Limitations**

This review which explored recommendations in clinical guidelines focused on the use of acupuncture for treating chronic pain as a general entity. It did not consider acupuncture treatment for specific pain in different locations, for which in many cases there is limited [73] clinical evidence or even if there is evidence it is largely ignored or omitted [74]. In addition, not all current international clinical guidelines documentation was covered as the aim of the paper was to highlight differences in the interpretation of evidence between different selected national and international organisations and stakeholders and compare and contrast these with the UK NICE guideline experience. A more comprehensive systematic evaluation is required as well as the use of evidence to underpin these guidelines and this will require an international collaborative effort.

**Putting the guidance into practice**

Despite the emphasis worldwide on the production of clinical guidelines, recommendations may not influence clinical practice with many doctors being unaware of guidance [75], thus more efforts are needed to promote these guidelines for clinical practice. Additionally, it will be important to provide further education for acupuncture professionals so that they can work smoothly with mainstream health care professionals that wish to refer their chronic pain patients. Given the rather limited provision of NHS acupuncture services after NICE’s original 2009 recommendation on acupuncture for low back pain (13, 14), the substantial decommissioning of acupuncture across the board in primary care in recent years, and the ever more perilous state of NHS finances, it remains to be seen whether this guideline will lead to widely available acupuncture for the UK public. Nevertheless, it will add significantly to its credibility within medicine, with knock-on effects throughout private practice (where most acupuncture is delivered in the UK) and into other countries.

**Author contributions:** All authors contributed equally to the article’s concept, writing and editing of this article.

**Financial support**: This article was not supported by any funding agency

**Declaration of Competing Interests:** The authors have no conflicts of interest to declare. Prof Nicola Robinson is Editor in Chief of the European Journal of Integrative Medicine

**Acknowledgements:**  N/A

**Data availability:** The literature used in this article is freely available in the public domain

**References**

1. Nicholas M, Vlaeyen JWS, Rief W, Barke A, Aziz O, Benoliel R, Cohen M, Evers S, Glamberardino MA, Goebel A, Korwisi B, Perrot S, Svensson P, Wang SJ, Treede RD, The IASP Taskforce for the classification of chronic pain. The IASP classification of chronic pain for ICD-11: chronic primary pain. Pain.2019;160: 28–37.
2. Scholz J. Finally, A Systematic Classification of Pain (the ICD-11). Practical Pain Management. 2020;19(3):30-32. https://www.practicalpainmanagement.com/resources/clinical-practice-guidelines/finally-systematic-classification-pain-icd-11.
3. NICE, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence. Guideline: Chronic pain in over 16s: assessment and management. Draft for consultation, August 2020. https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/indevelopment/gid-ng10069
4. Mackey S, Kao MC. Managing twin crises in chronic pain and prescription opioids BMJ 2019; 364: 1917 doi: https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.l917 Editorial
5. Busse JW, Guyatt GH, Carrasco A, Akl E, Agoritas T, da Costa B, Vandvik PO, Tugwell P, Stern S, Cooper L, Cull C, Grant G, Iorio A, Persaud N, Frank J. The 2017 Canadian guidelines for opioids for chronic non-cancer pain. 2017. Downloaded January 29, 2018 from: http://nationalpaincentre.mcmaster.ca/documents/Opioid%20GL%20for%20CMAJ\_01may2017.pdf
6. New South Wales Government ( NSWG). Chronic pain management. 2018. Downloaded December 18, 2018 from: <https://www.health.nsw.gov.au/pharmaceutical/doctors/Pages/chronic-pain-medical-practitioners.aspx#bookmark77>.
7. Centers for Disease Control (CDC). Guidelines for prescribing opioids for chronic pain.US Department of Health and Human Services, 2016. Downloaded August 27, 2020 from: <https://www.cdc.gov/drugoverdose/pdf/prescribing/Guidelines_Factsheet-a.pdf>
8. GSA, Government of South Australia. Opioid prescriptions in chronic pain conditions. Guidelines for South Australian General Practitioners (GPs). Drug & Alcohol Services South Australia, 2008. Downloaded June 20, 2018 from: <http://www.sahealth.sa.gov.au/wps/wcm/connect/7b1378004ddce5e2965efe6d722e1562/Opioid_prescription_chronic_pain_guidelines_for_SA_GPs_ALL.PDF?MOD=AJPERES&CACHE=NONE&CONTENTCACHE=NONE>
9. Chou R, Turner JA, Devine EB, et al. The effectiveness and risks of long-term opioid therapy for chronic pain: a systematic review for a National Institutes of Health Pathways to Prevention Workshop. *Ann Intern Med* 2015; 162**:** 276–86.
10. Curtis HJ, Croker R, Walker AJ, Richards GC, Quinlan J, Goldacre B. Opioid prescribing trends and geographical variation in England, 1998–2018: a retrospective database study. Lancet Psychiatry 2019;6:140–150.
11. British Pain Society. Opioids for persistent pain: summary of guidance on good practice from the British Pain Society. *Br J Pain* 2012; 6:9–10.
12. NHS England and NHS Improvement Southwest. Opioid prescribing for chronic pain. NHS.UK, 2020. Downloaded August 27, 2020 from: <https://www.england.nhs.uk/south/info-professional/safe-use-of-controlled-drugs/opioids/>
13. Hopper Koppelman M, Bovey M, Robinson N. Evidence is in the Eye of the Beholder: The case of the 2016 draft NICE Guidelines for Low Back Pain. European Journal of Integrative Medicine 2016; 8(4):321-323
14. Lai L, NICE should reconsider its recommendation to withdraw acupuncture from its 2016 guidelines on low back pain and sciatica. European Journal of Integrative Medicine 2016; 8(4) 329-331
15. National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE). Spinal cord stimulation for chronic pain of neuropathic or ischaemic origin (TA159). 2014 – (in 2014 the 2008 document was reviewed and reapproved). Downloaded August 7, 2020 from: <https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/ta159>.
16. National Health Service (NHS). Acupuncture. NHS 2016. Downloaded December 24, 2017 from: <https://www.nhs.uk/conditions/Acupuncture/>
17. National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE). Depression in adults: treatment and management (update). Draft published 18 July 2017. In development [GID-CGWAVE0725] Expected publication date: 12 May 2022 <https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/gid-cgwave0725/documents/html-content>
18. National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE). Transcutaneous electrical stimulation of the supraorbital nerve for treating and preventing migraine. Interventional procedures guidance [IPG559] Publication date: 25 May 2016 <https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/ipg559>
19. National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE). Spinal cord stimulation for chronic pain of neuropathic or ischaemic origin (TA159). 2008 nice.org.uk/guidance/ta159. Downloaded June 28, 2018.
20. Scottish Intercollegiate Guidelines Network (SIGN). 136 Management of Chronic Pain. A national clinical guideline. Edinburgh, 2013. www.sign.ac.uk
21. Scottish Intercollegiate Guidelines Network (SIGN). Managing chronic pain: a booklet for patients, their families and carers. Healthcare Improvement Scotland, 2018. Downloaded July 6, 2018 from: http://www.sign.ac.uk/assets/pat136.pdf
22. Scottish Intercollegiate Guidelines Network (SIGN). 136 Management of Chronic Pain. A national clinical guideline. Edinburgh, 2019. Downloaded February 27, 2020 from: https://www.sign.ac.uk/assets/sign136\_2019.pdf
23. All Wales Medicines Strategy Group (AWMSG). Persistent Pain Resources. October 2016. Downloaded December 27, 2017 from: http://www.awmsg.org/docs/awmsg/medman/Persistent%20Pain%20Resources%20-%20Signposting%20to%20Persistent%20Pain%20Resources.pdf
24. British Pain Society (BPS) Understanding and managing pain: information for patients. 2010. Downloaded August 22, 2015 from: https://www.britishpainsociety.org/static/uploads/resources/files/book\_understanding\_pain.pdf
25. American Chronic Pain Association (ACPA). ACPA resource guide to chronic pain medication and treatment, 2014. Downloaded November 7, 2014 from: http://www.theacpa.org
26. Joint Commission. Pain assessment and management standards for hospitals, August 2017. Downloaded February 7, 2018 from: https://www.jointcommission.org/assets/1/18/R3\_Report\_Issue\_11\_Pain\_Assessment\_8\_25\_17\_FINAL.pdf
27. U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (USDHHS). Pain Management Best Practices Inter-agency task force report. Updates, Gaps, Inconsistencies, and Recommendations. US Government, 2019. Downloaded March 13, 2020 from: https://www.hhs.gov/sites/default/files/pmtf-final-report-2019-05-23.pdf
28. NPS Medicinewise. For pharmacists – talking to your patients about changes in codeine access. Australian Government, Department of Health. 2017. Downloaded September 30, 2019 from: https://www.nps.org.au/professionals/codeine/for-pharmacists-talking-to-your-patients-about-changes-in-codeine-access
29. Health Navigator of New Zealand (HNNZ). Chronic pain. Royal New Zealand College of General Practitioners, 2019. https://www.healthnavigator.org.nz/health-a-z/c/chronic-pain/
30. eTG, Therapeutic Guidelines. Chronic pain: non-pharmacological management. www.tg.org.au, 2012. Downloaded October 2, 2019 from: https://tgldcdp.tg.org.au/searchAction?appendedInputButtons=acupuncture
31. Government of Canada. Comprehensive Medical Care Services. Public Service and Military, 2019. Downloaded September 5, 2019 from: https://www.canada.ca/en/department-national-defence/services/benefits-military/pay-pension-benefits/benefits/medical-dental/medical-care-services.html" https://www.canada.ca/en/department-national-defence/services/benefits-military/pay-pension-benefits/benefits/medical-dental/medical-care-services.html
32. European Pain Federation (EFIC). **Improving the Current and Future Management of Chronic Pain. Concensus report prepared for the European Parliament. 2010**
33. KBV, Gemeinsamer Bundesausschuss – Richtlinie, des Gemeinsamen Bundesausschusses zu Untersuchungs- und Behandlungsmethoden der vertragsärztlichen Versorgung (Guideline of the Federal Joint Committee on examination and treatment methods for statutory health care), 2015. Downloaded October 31, 2015 from: https://www.g-ba.de/downloads/62-492-1022/MVV-RL\_2015-02-19\_iK-2016-05-16.pdf" https://www.g-ba.de/downloads/62-492-1022/MVV-RL\_2015-02-19\_iK-2016-05-16.pdf
34. Breuer J, Reinsperger I, Piso B (2014). Akupunktur. Einsatzgebiete, Evidenzlage und gesicherte Indikationen. HTA Projektbericht Nr. 78. Wien: Ludwig Boltzmann Institut für Health Technology Assessment. . Downloaded October 31, 2016 from: http://eprints.hta.lbg.ac.at/1042/1/HTA-Projektbericht\_Nr.78.pdf
35. Birch S, Lee MS, Robinson N, Alraek T. The U.K. NICE 2014 Guidelines for Osteoarthritis of the Knee: Lessons Learned in a Narrative Review Addressing Inadvertent Limitations and Bias. J Altern Complem Med. 2017;23(4):242–246.
36. MacPherson H. NICE for some interventions, but not so NICE for others: questionable guidance on acupuncture for osteoarthritis and low-back pain. J Altern Complem Med. 2017;23(4):247–248.
37. Bovey M. Acupuncture for osteoarthritis in the UK: A turning point for NICE? European Journal of Integrative Medicine 2016; 8: 337-341
38. Chou R, Deyo R, Friedly J, Skelly A, Hashimoto R, Weimer M, Fu R, Dana T, Kraegel P, Griffin J, Grusing S, Brodt ED. Nonpharmacologic Therapies for Low Back Pain: A Systematic Review for an American College of Physicians Clinical Practice Guideline. [Ann Intern Med.](about:blank) 2017 Apr 4;166(7):493-505. doi: 10.7326/M16-2459. PMID: 28192793.
39. [Qaseem A](about:blank), [Wilt TJ](about:blank), [McLean RM](about:blank), [Forciea MA](about:blank); [Clinical Guidelines Committee of the American College of Physicians](about:blank). Noninvasive Treatments for Acute, Subacute, and Chronic Low Back Pain: A Clinical Practice Guideline from the American College of Physicians. [Ann Intern Med.](about:blank) 2017 Feb 14. doi: 10.7326/M16-2367. [Epub ahead of print]
40. Ambrósio EMM, Bloor K, MacPherson H. Costs and consequences of acupuncture as a treatment for chronic pain: A systematic review of economic evaluations conducted alongside randomised controlled trials. Complem Ther in Med 2012; 20:364-374.
41. Andronis L, Kinghorn P, Qiao S, Whitehurst DGT, Durrell S, McLeod H. Cost-Effectiveness of Non-Invasive and Non-Pharmacological Interventions for Low Back Pain: a Systematic Literature Review. Appl Health Econ Health Policy. 2017 Apr;15(2) 173-201. DOI 10.1007/s40258-016-0268-8
42. Herman PM, Poindexter BL, Witt CM, Eisenberg DM. Are complementary therapies and integrative care cost-effective? A systematic review of economic evaluations. BMJ Open 2012;2:e001046. doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2012-001046
43. Kim N, Yang B, Lee T, Kwon S. An economic analysis of usual care and acupuncture collaborative treatment on chronic low back pain: a Markov model decision analysis. BMC Complement Altern Med. 2010 Nov 25;10:74. doi: 10.1186/1472-6882-10-74.
44. Liao C-C, Liao K-R, Lin C-L and Li J-M (2020) Long-Term Effect of Acupuncture on the Medical Expenditure and Risk of Depression and Anxiety in Migraine Patients: A Retrospective Cohort Study. Front. Neurol. 11:321. doi: 10.3389/fneur.2020.00321
45. Mao JJ, Kapur R. Acupuncture in Primary Care. Prim Care. 2010;37(1): 105–117. doi: 10.1016/j.pop.2009.09.010
46. Woods B, Manca A, Weatherly H, Saramago P, Sideris E, Giannopoulou C, et al. (2017) Cost-effectiveness of adjunct non-pharmacological interventions for osteoarthritis of the knee. PLoS ONE 12(3): e0172749. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0172749
47. Appleyard I, Lundeberg T, Robinson N. Should systematic reviews assess the risk of bias from sham–placebo acupuncture control procedures? Eur J Integr Med 2014; 6:234-243. doi.org/10.1016/j.eujim.2014.03.004
48. Birch S, Alraek T, Kim KH, Lee MS. Chapter 4 Placebo controlled trials in acupuncture: problems and solutions. In Evidence Based Chinese Medicine. In S. Leung and H. Hu (eds.), Evidence-based Research Methods for Chinese Medicine, 2016, pages 55-64. DOI 10.1007/978-981-10-2290-6\_4.
49. Zhang CS, Tan HY, Zhang GS, Zhang AL, Xue CC, Xie YM (2015) Placebo Devices as Effective Control Methods in Acupuncture Clinical Trials: A Systematic Review. PLoS ONE 10(11): e0140825. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0140825
50. Zhang ZJ, Wang XM, McAlonan GM. Neural Acupuncture Unit: A New Concept for Interpreting Effects and Mechanisms of Acupuncture. Evidence-Based Complementary and Alternative Medicine Volume 2012, Article ID 429412, 23 pages doi:10.1155/2012/429412
51. NIHMedline Plus. Chronic pain, 2011;6(1):4. Downloaded February 1, 2019 from: https://medlineplus.gov/magazine/issues/spring11/articles/spring11pg4.html
52. Williams N, DeBattista C. Chapter 25. Psychiatric disorders. In: Papadakis MA, McPhee SJ, Rabow MW. eds. Current Medical Diagnosis & Treatment 2017. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill; 2017. Found through search of book on-line on February 28, 2017 at: http://accessmedicine.mhmedical.com/
53. McDonald J, Janz S. The acupuncture evidence project: a comparative evidence review. Australian Acupuncture and Chinese Medicine Association, January 2017. Downloaded February 17, 2017 from: http://www.acupuncture.org.au.
54. Hempel S, Taylor SL, Solloway M, Miake-Lye IM, Beroes JM, Shanman R, Booth MJ, Siroka AM, Shekelle PG. Evidence Map of acupuncture. US Department of Veterans Affairs - Evidence Synthesis Program. Project #05-226; 2013. Downloaded April 6, 2015 from: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmedhealth/PMH0063214/pdf/TOC.pdf
55. Birch S, Lee MS, Alraek T, Kim TH. Overview of treatment guidelines and clinical practical guidelines that recommend the use of acupuncture: a bibliometric analysis. J Altern Complem Med. 2018;24(8):752-769. DOI: 10.1089/acm.2018.009
56. Vickers AJ, Versotick EA, Lewith G, MacPherson H, Foster NE, Sherman KJ, Irnich D, Witt CM, Linde K, on behalf of the Acupuncture Trialists’ Collaboration. Acupuncture for Chronic Pain: Update of an Individual Patient Data Meta-Analysis. The Journal of Pain, Vol 19, No 5 (May), 2018: pp 455-474. Available online at www.jpain.org and www.sciencedirect.com
57. Nahin RL, Boineau R, Khalsa PS, Stussman BJ, Weber WJ. Evidence-Based Evaluation of Complementary Health Approaches for Pain Management in the United States. Mayo Clin Proc. 2016;91(9):1292-1306
58. Saramago P, Woods B, Weatherly H, Manca A, Sculpher M, Khan K, Vickers AJ, MacPherspon H. Methods for network meta-analysis of continuous outcomes using individual patient data: a case study in acupuncture for chronic pain. BMC Medical Research Methodology (2016) 16:131. DOI 10.1186/s12874-016-0224-1
59. Skelly AC, Chou R, Dettori JR, Turner JA, Friedly JL, Rundell SD, Fu R, Brodt ED, Wasson N, Kantner S, Ferguson AJR. Noninvasive Nonpharmacological Treatment for Chronic Pain: A Systematic Review Update. Comparative Effectiveness Review No. 227. (Prepared by the Pacific Northwest Evidence-based Practice Center under Contract No. 290-2015-00009-I.) AHRQ Publication No. 20-EHC009. Rockville, MD: Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality; April 2020. DOI: https://doi.org/10.23970/AHRQEPCCER227
60. MacPherson H, Vertosick EA, Foster NE, Lewith G, Linde K, Sherman KJ, Witt CM, Vickers AJ, On behalf of the Acupuncture Trialists’ Collaboration. The persistence of the effects of acupuncture after a course of treatment: a meta-analysis of patients with chronic pain. Pain, 2017;158:784–793
61. Bosch P, van den Noort M, Staudte H, Lim S. Schizophrenia and Depression: A systematic Review of the Effectiveness and the Working Mechanisms Behind Acupuncture. Explore (NY). 2015 Apr 28. pii: S1550-8307(15)00065-8. doi: 10.1016/j.explore.2015.04.004.
62. Zhang ZX, Li CR, Rong PJ, Bai ZH, Hill AM, Jing Q, Ren L, Wang CY. Efficacy and Safety of Auricular Therapy for Depression. Medical Acupuncture. October 2016, 28(5): 256-267. [https://doi.org/10.1089/acu.2016.1182](about:blank)
63. Zhang Y, Qu SS, Zhang JP, Sun YL, Liu WL, Xie L, Huang Y, Chen JQ. Rapid onset of the effects of the combined selective serotonin uptake inhibitors and electroacupuncture on primary depression: a meta-analysis. J Altern Complem Med. 2016; 22(1):1-8.
64. Yan B, Zhu S, Wang Y, Da G, Tian G. Effect of Acupuncture on Chronic Pain with Depression: A Systematic Review. Evid Based Complement Alternat Med. 2020 Jun 25;2020:7479459. doi: 10.1155/2020/7479459
65. Hopton A, Macpherson H, Keding A, Morley S. Acupuncture, counselling or usual care for depression and comorbid pain: secondary analysis of a randomised controlled trial.. BMJ Open. 2014 May 2;4(5):e004964
66. Amorim D, Amado J, Brito I, Fiuza SM, Amorim N, Costeira C, Machado J. Acupuncture and electroacupuncture for anxiety disorders: A systematic review of the clinical research. Complementary Therapies in Clinical Practice. 2018;31:31e37.
67. Ma R, Xu SJ, Wen XY, Wu Q, Wu YN, Huang YF, Fu WB. Acupuncture for Generalized Anxiety Disorder: A Systematic Review. J Psychol Psychother 2014;5(4):155. doi: 10.4172/2161-0487.1000155
68. Shin NY, Lim YJ, Yang CH, Kim C. Acupuncture for Alcohol Use Disorder: A Meta-Analysis. eCAM. Volume 2017, Article ID 7823278, 6 pages http://dx.doi.org/10.1155/2017/7823278
69. Southern C, Lloyd C, Liu JP, Wang CC, Zhang TT, Bland M, MacPherson H. Acupuncture as an intervention to reduce alcohol dependency: a systematic review and meta‑analysis. Chin Med (2016) 11:49. DOI 10.1186/s13020-016-0119-4
70. Shergis J, Ni X, Jackson M, Zhang A, Gao X, Li Y, Lu C, Xue C. A systematic review of acupuncture for sleep quality in people with insomnia, Complementary Therapies in Medicine, 2016;26:11-20.
71. Asadpour R, Meng ZQ, Kessel KA, Combs SE. Use of acupuncture to alleviate side effects in radiation oncology: Current evidence and future directions. Advances in Radiation Oncology 2016;1:344-350.
72. Birch S. **Acupuncture and chronic pain – the case of back pain. Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services, US Government, CMS.gov, 2019. https://www.cms.gov/medicare-coverage-database/staticpages/public-comment.aspx?commentID=31450&ReportType=nca**
73. Hegmann, K.T., Hoffman, H.E., Belcourt, R.M. and et al. (2013) ACOEM practice guidelines: elbow disorders. Journal of Occupational and Environmental Medicine 55(11), 1365-1374

74 Schneider HP, Baca JM, Carpenter BB, Dayton PD, Fleischer AE, Sachs BD. American College of Foot and Ankle Surgeons clinical consensus statement: diagnosis and treatment of adult acquired infracalcaneal heel pain. J Foot Ankle Surg. 2018;57(2):370-381

75. Czarnawska-Iliev I, Robinson N. General Practitioners’ use of and attitudes to acupuncture in relation to the UK’s National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE) clinical guidelines—A pilot study. European Journal of Integrative Medicine 2016: 8(4); 342-354. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.eujim.2016.07.004>